

CHANGING LANDSCAPES

Women in Arts and Media Professions: UK¹⁸⁹

Gillian Swanson with Andy Feist and Trevor Jones¹⁹⁰

1. Profiling the Arts and Media Professions

Recent moves towards developing newly comprehensive policy frameworks for the cultural industries have enabled us to address arts and media professions in a common structure: the *cultural industries*. This strategy allows us to include the range of fine arts and crafts alongside the applied arts of the newer cultural industries such as advertising, design and fashion, as well as those sectors which would traditionally be perceived as 'industries', such as music, media and publishing. With the move to new information technologies this makes especially good sense. For there are few areas of the arts and media professions which are not being in some way adapted to digital technologies - in terms of required skills sets, working conditions, and the means of production and dissemination - and influenced by their intersection with the rapidly emerging new media industries.

The UK Government has identified 'creative industries' as an embracing term for this sector. In the recent Department of Culture Media and Sport's *Creative Industries Mapping Document* it is defined as 'those activities which have their origin in individual creativity, skill and talent and which have a potential for wealth and job creation through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property' (DCMS 1998b: 3). While the creative industries in the UK employ more than 1.4 million people, this includes many working in non-creative occupations, and there are additionally around 450,000 creative people employed in other industries. In all, the total *creative* workforce – in and out of the creative industries - is estimated to be around 1.4 million which is 5% of the total employed workforce (DCMS 1998b: 8). This would clearly increase if those working as freelance/self-employed or on short term contracts were also counted (Casey, 1999: 42). Since the creative industries generate £60bn in revenues, it has become an important sector in the UK's employment and industry profile, but the Creative Industries Task Force notes that a co-ordinated approach to promote their development still has to be formulated (DCMS 1998b: 3).

As we see in the Creative Industries Task Force *Creative Industries Mapping Document*, the data available on income and employment differs across the industries which comprise the sector, pointing to a lack of consistent reporting protocols which hampers co-ordinated sectoral analysis. Similarly, statistical classifications are not currently responsive to the flow of la-

¹⁸⁹ This text was originally produced in English.

¹⁹⁰ Gillian Swanson is Senior Lecturer in Cultural Studies, University of the West of England. Trevor Jones is Lecturer in the School of Social Sciences at Cardiff University and Andy Feist is Honorary Senior Research Fellow, City University London. Research Assistance was conducted by Jo Haynes and Rhianon Bayliss. Additional support from the Arts Council of England in the preparation of this text is gratefully acknowledged.

bour across private and publicly funded enterprises and activities, and across employee and self-employed freelance categories.

More specifically, there is a chronic and pervasive lack of reporting of gendered employment statistics in all areas except the broadcast media industries. The patchiness of the gender profile covered by the *Creative Industries Mapping Document* is one sign of the lack of widespread or consistent reporting and monitoring protocols, making it impossible to compare women's employment and career progression between industries and identify clear areas for equity policy to be addressed. One example of the data and reporting gap relating to women in the cultural professions is the lack of any gender breakdown of staff in libraries at a national level. This is all the more surprising not only because about three quarters of librarians are women, but also because this gap exists despite a vigorous and exciting funded programme of research into new professional profiles and competencies, models of management and industry futures by national bodies¹⁹¹. This suggests that the value of such statistical profiling and research into gendered employment patterns has yet to be realised as part of industry profiling and planning processes. Appropriate protocols regarding the reporting of employment patterns are crucial to effective policy mechanisms, including those falling within cultural diversity and social inclusion frameworks.

2. Women's Employment in the Arts and Cultural Sector

What is clear, is that while these industries are heterogeneous in their working practices and patterns, women are still underrepresented in the sector as a whole. Growth in female employment in the cultural sector has, however, been considerable in recent years and women increased their representation over the decade 1981-1991 in all the main occupational groups except for musicians. In certain occupational groups - for example as musicians and photographers - women are still poorly represented, at under a quarter of the workforce, and while they form a majority in particular 'feminised' industries such as libraries, at over seventy per cent, they still find it difficult to progress to positions of seniority (Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995).

In this paper, we will give a more detailed profile of women's patterns of employment, income, qualifications and training, and progression to 'top job' categories, senior production and direction classifications and their involvement in management, across the cultural sector. To provide this, we consulted the major sources of official employment statistics¹⁹², trade union and sectoral peak bodies (e.g. professional organisations) and an extensive range of ex-

¹⁹¹ National bodies representing the library sector, conducting research or holding data on libraries include the Library and Information Commission and the Library Association, and the existence of a specialist national Library and Information Statistical Unit based at Loughborough University.

¹⁹² The main source of detailed information on employment patterns in Britain is the government's Labour Force Survey (LFS), which has been carried out since 1973. The survey took place every two years until 1983, before becoming an annual survey (covering about 150,000 individuals). From 1992, the LFS became a quarterly survey, and this paper will include some findings from the most recent data available, the Winter 1998/99 LFS. A third source of information on employment is Census of Employment and its successor survey the Annual Employment Survey (AES). This covers employment through workplaces and measures only employees in employment (i.e. they exclude the self-employed). Although this source identifies the number of full time and part time employees by gender for each SIC, it only captures employees it omits and therefore misses an important slice of total employment of the cultural sector (see below). Another source of official statistics is the New Earnings Survey (NES). This is an annual survey of levels, distributions and components of earnings, as well as hours worked. It is based upon a one per cent sample of employees drawn at random from the Pay As You Earn (PAYE) scheme in April. Results are reported for industrial and occupational groups, although due to small sample sizes it is difficult to provide any detailed analysis by gender for artistic

isting studies. These sources, however, organise their data according to different categories and definitions, so a unified picture of the sector as we define it is difficult to obtain: we therefore present the information that is accessible according to the models which these sources use.

Women in Cultural Occupations

Data from the Census of Employment and Labour Force Survey confirms that overall, women are under-represented in cultural occupations, although it also shows the considerable variation between sub-sectors. *Table 1* illustrates the percentage of women in different cultural occupations as shown in the 1991 Census.

Table 1: Individuals with cultural occupations, by gender, 1991

Cultural occupations	% Women
Librarians	70
Archivists and curators	50
Authors, writers and journalists	43
Artists, commercial artists and graphic designers	38
Industrial designers	39
Clothing designers	83
Actors, entertainers, stage managers, producers, directors	40
Musicians	23
Photographers, camera, sound, video equipment operators	18
Musical instrument makers, piano tuners	12
All cultural occupations	39

Source: 1991 Census. Derived from O'Brien and Feist, 1995.

At the beginning of the 1990s, women were particularly under-represented in three occupational groups: musicians; photographers, camera and sound equipment operators; and 'musical instrument makers/piano tuners'. In all of these sectors over three quarters of the individuals are male. Relatively feminised sectors included librarians (70 per cent female), and clothing designers (of whom 83 per cent were female). There were equal proportions of women and men in the archivist and curator category.

Although the data are not directly comparable, in broad terms it appears that this picture remained similar at the end of the 1990s. The LFS data for 1998/99 (see *Table 2*) suggest that taken as a whole, the gender balance within cultural occupations was similar to that recorded by the 1991 Census, with about 39 per cent of employment in these occupations being accounted for by women. In terms of the particular sectors, there remained a relative over-representation of men in particular among musicians, and among photographers and camera

and cultural industries/occupations. A further limitation of this data is that, like the AES, the survey covers employees only. Nevertheless, given the relative lack of data on income and earnings, we also report some findings from the NES in later sections. Useful data are data held by professional organisations and trade unions, and there is also data collected by the Arts Council of England in regular surveys of funded organisations (although clearly this covers only a part of the sector). Finally there are various studies - both qualitative and quantitative - of individual sectors within the arts and cultural industries which provide a more detailed view of the position of women within particular sub-sectors.

equipment operators. As at the beginning of the decade, the vast majority of librarians are women.

Table 2: Employment in cultural occupations, 1998/99 +

Cultural occupations, 1999	N=	% Women
Librarians/archivists	29,889	78
Authors	108,805	37
Artists	112,631	38
Industrial/clothing designers	31,663	49
Actors	72,658	42
Musicians	30,758	26
Photographers, camera, sound and video equipment operators	46,024	15
Musical instrument makers and piano tuners*	4,236	18
All cultural occupations	436,664	39

Source: LFS Winter 1998/99.

+ Main job only.

* Since these cells are based on estimates that total less than 10,000 the figures are not reliable taken alone.

Women in Cultural Industries

The cultural industries comprise a wider range of occupations over and above those directly associated with cultural or artistic activities. There is a greater gender balance amongst people employed in the cultural industries, with 54 per cent of employment accounted for by women.

Table 3: Gender balance in different cultural industries, 1998/99

Cultural Industry	N=	% Women
Publishing books/journals & reproduction of recorded media	95,257	50
(Book publishing)	39,252	56
(Journal publishing)	44,049	51
Photographic activities	38,119	29
TV, video and film	123,744	36
(Radio and television)	81,090	35
Artistic and creative professions	130,418	41
Library, archives, museums	90,384	70
(Library and archives)	51,639	80
(Museums etc.)	38,744	57
All cultural industries	482,845	54

Source: LFS Winter 1998/99.

The library sector is unsurprisingly characterised by very high levels of female employment, and the publishing industry appears to employ about equal proportions of men and women. Women are relatively under-represented in the TV, video and film sector and in photographic activities.

Change Over Time

Between 1981 and 1991 there were a number of areas of particularly marked change in women's involvement in the cultural sector. In all the main occupational groups except for musicians, women increased their representation. The occupational category of 'musicians' is the only one to show a decline in the proportion of women working. However, change was far more marked in some occupational groups than others. The occupational category of photographers, camera operators and sound/video operators have shown some change, but remains largely male dominated. Women have continued to increase their representation in other occupational classifications, and have made particularly strong advances in the artist/commercial artist sector, and authors/writers etc.

In terms of overall numbers, the greatest expansion of women has been seen in two occupations: 'artists/commercial artists etc.' and 'clothing designers'. Only one group saw a significant decline, that of window dressers, which relates to a general decline in the numbers employed in these occupations.

Employment Status : By Cultural Occupations

As in the labour market as a whole, women in the cultural sector are more likely than men to work part-time (*Table 4*). This trend holds across the five main occupational groups selected for analysis. However, the tendency is significantly less marked in the cultural sector than in the wider labour market because there is a much lower rate of part-time work among women in cultural occupations.

The level of contrast varies across the five main occupational groups, and is greatest among photographers and camera, sound and video equipment operators, where only two per cent of the men work part-time compared to 17 per cent of the women. Women musicians are three times as likely as men to work part-time, with almost a third of them in this category. It seems that the disparity in part-time working between men and women is greatest in occupational groups where women are still relatively under-represented. Thus, among musicians and photographers, sound, video equipment operators etc. there are still substantially higher rates of part-time workers among women. We might speculate that among occupations where women are significantly under-represented there is a greater likelihood that those relatively few women who are there will be confined to less secure and marginal jobs, including part-time working.

Part-time working for women has increased across most cultural occupations, but not as much as in the wider labour market. There is variation between occupations in these increases, but the highest increases in the numbers of part-time workers were found among 'actors, entertainers etc', 'artists/commercial artists' and authors and writers. There was a marked decrease in part-time working among women musicians.

Table 4: Employment status of men and women with cultural occupations in per cent (1991 Census)

Cultural Occupation	FT employee	PT employee	Self-employed (employees)	Self-employed (no employees)	Un-employed	Total
Authors, writers, journalists						
Men	61	3	3	28	5	100
Women	55	10	1	30	3	100
Artists, graphic designers etc.						
Men	46	2	7	36	9	100
Women	43	10	4	36	7	100
Actors, entertainers						
Men	37	4	5	37	15	100
Women	40	8	3	31	16	100
Musicians						
Men	10	9	4	64	12	100
Women	10	30	2	52	6	100
Photographer, sound & video equip.						
Men	49	2	7	33	9	100
Women	49	17	3	25	7	100
Total						
Men	51	3	8	30	8	100
Women	50	12	4	27	7	100

Source: O'Brien and Feist, 1995.

Another notable feature of the cultural sector is the greater level of self-employment compared to the wider labour market (*Table 5*). The most striking change over the decade 1981-1991 is the very significant growth in the numbers of self-employed women in some occupational groups. Growth in self employment was particularly marked for artists/commercial artists etc, and clothing designers. Comparatively small increases in the numbers of self-employed women were found among musicians, and among actors and entertainers.

Table 5: Percentage change in employment profile of women with cultural occupations 1981-91

Occupational group	Full-time employees	Part-time employees	Self-employed	Total
Authors, writers, journalists	+74	+73	+117	+86
Artists, commercial artists	+79	+79	+249	+135
Industrial designers	+23	-	+101	+43
Clothing designers	+60	+27	+295	+118
Window dressers	-46	-31	+117	-38
Actors, entertainers etc.	+79	+89	+59	+71
Musicians	-15	-24	+22	-1
Photographers, cameramen	+11	+24	+91	+35
Sound and vision equipment operators	19	+17	+100	+22

Source: O'Brien and Feist (1995) 1991 Census.

The vast majority of the self-employed in cultural occupations are freelancers without employees. Over a third of those with cultural occupations are self-employed, compared to about 14 per cent of people in the wider labour market. Again, the contrasts between men and women in cultural occupations is much less marked than is the case in the wider labour market. Although men in cultural occupations are about twice as likely to be self-employed with

employees, they account for only a minority of self-employed people. Men and women in cultural occupations have a similar likelihood of working as self-employed freelancers, which at around 27-30 per cent is substantially higher than their counterparts in the wider labour market. The contrast is particularly marked for women, of whom only 4 per cent work as freelancers in the labour market as a whole.

The correspondence of a lower rate of part-time employment amongst women in the sector compared to the labour force generally and an increase in self-employment without employees (i.e. freelance status) amongst women with cultural occupations suggests that freelance work may function to some extent as part-time work does in other sectors: *as an employment option for women with domestic responsibilities*. Sector-specific research would be essential to establish this and to determine the effects of a greater incidence of freelance work amongst women in this sector, since there has been significant growth in the numbers of self-employed women in some occupational groups, particularly artists/commercial artists etc and clothing designers, but only small increases amongst musicians and actors and entertainers (see *Table 4*). Women freelancers could become a key target alongside women part-time employees for the development and testing of measures aimed at ensuring that women do not lose out in the employment market as a result of their need to combine work with other responsibilities.

Employment Status : By Cultural Industries

High levels of self-employment are more marked when looking at industries than in looking at occupations. Of particular note are the very high levels of self-employment among both men and women in the film distribution and production industry, where almost half of all women are self-employed. The highest rates of self-employment, though, are found among the authors, composers and artists industry group, where over four fifths of both men and women are self-employed.

Hours Worked

For cultural occupations as a whole, at the beginning of the 1990s, there were not huge differences between men and women in the pattern of weekly hours worked (Census, 1991). Differences between women and men occur most markedly in very low or very high weekly working hours.

However, these general patterns vary within particular cultural occupations. The contrast between men and women is most visible in three categories 'artists, commercial artists, graphic designers'; 'musicians' and 'photographers, camera, sound and video equipment operators'. Among the artist and graphic designers group, men are eight times less likely to work less than 15 hours in a week, and almost twice as likely to work over 41 hours. Among musicians, higher proportions of men work shorter hours, with 12 per cent working under 15 hours a week. However, almost a third of female musicians find themselves in this category. Of male musicians, 17 per cent were working more than 41 hours a week in 1991, which was over twice the proportion of women in this category. Women in the photographers, camera, sound and video equipment operators category were five times as likely to work less than 15 hours in a week and just over half as likely as men to be working more than 41 hours. It is worth adding that among the actors and entertainers group, men were substantially more likely than women to be working longer hours, which supports the conclusions of other studies (eg. Thomas, 1992) that male actors are offered more work than female actors. Few differences were found in terms of hours worked when male and female librarians were compared, and

hours worked by male and female musical instrument makers/tuners were rather similar (although this group is very small).

Income

A significant obstacle to examining income levels in the cultural sector is that there is no data on the income of the self-employed recorded in official statistics. Nevertheless, although the degree of disparity differs across sectors, it is clear that in general, income levels for women in the arts and cultural industries are significantly lower than those of men despite women having higher levels of qualification and in particular, higher levels of higher artistic qualifications across all occupational categories (O'Brien and Feist, 1995: 82). However, the gender-related earnings differential appears to be much larger in the non-manual sector of the general labour force than it is in the cultural sector.

The average gross weekly wage of male employees in our definition of *cultural industries* was about 26 per cent higher than that of women employees. The difference was less marked when cultural *occupations* were taken as the base, but men still earned on average 17 per cent more per week (1998/99 Winter LFS). When comparing the average *hourly* earnings, the disparity is still evident: male employees in the cultural industries earn 21% more than women. Furthermore, male earnings appear to have been rising at a faster rate (10 per cent across 1997-98 compared to seven per cent for women) (Source: NES, 1998).¹⁹³

The clustering of women in lower level positions is clearly a factor influencing income levels. This is a pervasive and enduring pattern in the media industries, for example, but in the case of the library sector, which retains a more formalised career hierarchy and has a majority of female employees, women were still only half as likely to work in posts with higher income levels as men in a 1995 study (Baehr, 1996: 53; Poland, Curran and Owens 1995: ii)¹⁹⁴. Women's ability to attract as much work as men, and charge as much for their work (in crafts industries, for example) has also been questioned (Throsby, 1992; Towse, 1993; Thomas, 1992; DCMS, 1998: 32).

Women's lower income levels have also been attributed to their greater involvement in part-time work, their lower age profile and experience levels, or clustering in different job types. Yet while these may all be influential, there seems to be a more endemic problem, studies which have controlled these factors have found that after adjustment, the income levels of women are still consistently lower than those of men (British Film Institute, 1999: 21; Gallagher, 1998: 37, Woolf and Holly, 1995: v, vii). In the media sector, differences are most acute at the top and the bottom of the income scales: there are more women earning the lowest levels of income and very few earning the highest income levels (British Film Institute, 1999: 20; Woolf and Holly, 1995: 45). Most alarmingly, considering these patterns of inequality, men's incomes increased to a greater extent than women's incomes from 1994-8 in the television in-

¹⁹³ The published sections of the New Earnings Survey provide information about earnings differentials for employees in industrial divisions down to three digits. The NES published in 1998 records that men's weekly earnings were on average 35% higher than those of women (£426.80 compared to £327.40) whereas hourly earnings were 21% higher (£10.65 compared to £8.79). The NES has a number of limitations when approaching detailed sectoral analysis of earnings: comparison between males and females is difficult because the data are presented in different bands. Nevertheless, given the paucity of available data on earnings in the arts sector, it is worth including some information from the NES.

¹⁹⁴ Only 9% of women, but 20% of men were in posts earning over £27,000 (Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995: ii).

dustry (British Film Institute, 1999: 20). This last pattern is not uniform across sectors, however. Within the crafts industries, for example, where women have historically earned much less than men, women's incomes are increasing more rapidly than those of men (DCMS, 1998: 32).

Income levels have yet to be fully analysed in ways that allow an assessment of the impact of the range of factors influencing income differentials and the degree of variation across sectors. One important dimension of income differentials is the disparity in earnings between traditionally male and traditionally female occupational areas: in the media sector for example, it was found that the occupational areas with women as a majority of the workforce are the lowest paid: hence some investigation is needed into the relative levels of pay across occupational categories (Woolf, Holly and Varlaam 1994: iv; Gallagher, 1998: 37). This is particularly important in the light of the growing feminisation of the arts and cultural sector: a systematic audit of skills levels demanded by different occupational categories, cross referred with income levels, would form a useful template against which women's inequality could be more accurately identified, monitored and addressed, and a series of ameliorative measures identified. Further elaboration of these patterns of inequality would require a closely focused and detailed approach to assessing patterns of gender difference in employment practice: Gallagher suggests, for example, that one factor in earnings differentials could be the kinds of assignment given to women and men in the same occupational category, and the relative economic and professional valuation given to these (Gallagher, 1998: 37).

Another key factor is the impact of maternity leave, having children or other family responsibilities on career progression. While the situation of freelancers is particularly notable in this respect (see below), even in sectors which are characterised by more clearly identifiable 'ladders of progression', the impact of their family responsibilities on women working is clearly significant. In the library sector 35% of women but no men had to stop working as a result of childcare responsibilities and were far more likely to consider hours fitting with domestic responsibilities as their main criterion in planning their future career, while women who had worked part-time or had children were less likely to earn higher income levels than men, and nearly three times the proportion of women reported that having children had imposed career constraints in proportions three times higher than those of men (Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995: ii-iii).

3. Changing Patterns, Changing Conditions: Issues Relating to Women's Career Development and Progression

Patterns of self-employment and freelance work in the sector, which have always been high within the visual and performing arts, are consolidating and increasing, and women have particularly high rates of freelance/self-employment in this sector in comparison with the labour force generally. The increase in the proportion of small businesses and Small to Medium Sized Enterprises (SMEs), and the associated increase in outsourcing and freelance/self-employment or short term contract work is one pattern which is developing particularly strongly in the broadcast media sector, and is already established as a key feature of new media industries (Baehr, 1996: I; Swanson and Wise, 1999: 52-3).

The proliferation of smaller business units is particularly significant in the context of the:

- expanding crafts and design industries;
- strengthening of the music industry in domestic and overseas markets with independent companies as their core;

- 'cottage industry' profile of the film industry in the UK (DCMS, 1998);
- increase of outsourcing of television and radio production by broadcasters to smaller independent companies (Gallagher, 1998: 9);
- move to low cost electronic publishing, and
- development of the new media industries which are characterised by business units of below 12 employees, practices of outsourcing and the use of contract staff (DCMS, 1998b: 7).

Some sectors, for example libraries, are presently protected from this devolution by the extent of public sector involvement: about 97% of librarians are permanently employed.

Nevertheless, the move to contract and freelance/self-employment as a pattern of working, particularly as a replacement for part-time work, will constitute a significant characteristic of employment in the next century. The individual operating as a freelance or sole-trader is already well established as a pattern elsewhere in the arts and cultural sector. Similarly, the proliferation of the small business unit – so prevalent in the cultural industries - which benefits from outsourcing from larger companies and the 'streamlining' of the public sector, is becoming a more pervasive and influential industry type.

What Are the Effects of the Prevalence of Self-Employment and Small Businesses on Patterns of Work in the Cultural Sector?

Several difficulties for employees flow from a cultural sector made up of small businesses, which are based on low investment and short term funding, leading to structural instability (Casey, 1998: 45). Adopting a freelance or self-employment status cultivates the versatility and adaptability that equips women to work in new employment contexts and offers them the flexibility which can be used to create a greater balance between work and home life. But it is likely to be based on working across a range of small companies, which means that the structural instability of small businesses and SMEs becomes translated into an insecure employment context for those who work on a freelance and short-term contract basis, and conditions of work which replicate those of part-time and casual workers, such as the lack of pension entitlements, sick leave, health cover and personal insurance, etc.

In general, employees in the arts and cultural industries are highly qualified, highly mobile but have a high drop-out rate (O'Brien and Feist, 1997: ii). This suggests that the industry is not able to provide the appropriate level of employment or income for a skilled workforce, and that individuals are not able to develop the working situations that allow them to sustain careers within the arts and cultural sector.

Clearly, the prevalence of this pattern suggests a sectoral response should be made. Improvements would impact on women as a significant component of the arts and cultural workforce. Cultural industry measures addressing these new patterns should be constituted into a package designed to:

- create mobility for individual employees, including such measures as information provision and networking programs with women's needs and patterns in mind, ongoing training to adapt to and identify new employment opportunities, and enterprise development support to allow individuals to move from freelance to self-employment, alongside other measures aimed at developing 'fair flexibility' such as the development of tailored pension schemes and social security entitlements (Hewitt, 1995: 46);

- encourage wealth generation, sustainability and the ability to identify and expand into new markets for small businesses within the cultural industries, including partnerships, Research and Development (R&D) consortia and business networks to increase investment and maximise competitiveness while pooling resources.

These measures would allow greater buoyancy to develop, allowing the sector to offer greater opportunities and decrease employees' – and especially freelancers' - vulnerability to risk. Rather than allowing flexibility to become a synonym for a low paid and casual workforce whose ability to work is subject to the vagaries of industry requirements and fortune, a strong culture of mobility and sustainability in the sector would allow women to build on their clear preference for flexible working practices in ways that offered viable career paths and opportunities without sacrificing income.

The balance of work and home responsibilities is a key consideration for women in their fashioning of arts/cultural careers, frequently leading them to choose to work in a freelance/self-employed capacity. Women in the arts and cultural industries demonstrate the patterns of adaptability that fit them for self-employment, demonstrate a 'disposition for sustainability', and some research has shown that they may be more inclined to develop a business in the arts and cultural sector than to apply for arts funding (Swanson and Wise, 1998: 76-81). However, there is a question concerning how far women are able to fashion *viable* careers with sustainable income levels and a flexibility that works for them rather than against their family interests.

Broadcast Media, Film and Video: A Case Study of the Situation of Women Freelances

The development and implications of the move to a 'publishing house' model and its associated dependence on freelance labour and short-term contracts has been the subject of research for a period of at least five years in the media sector, in which sixty per cent of all workers are freelance (Woolf, Holly and Varlaam, 1994, v; Caple and Melbourne, 1997: 11). As Willis and Dex note, the TV industry 'experienced in an extreme way what other British industries have experienced to a lesser degree': the 'majority of employees in all organisational settings are on short-term contracts of less than a year and are freelance workers' (Willis and Dex, 1999: 3, 6). A casual workforce has 'removed the ladders of career progression' and most contracts are based within smaller units with a flatter organisational structure: while career entry is probably easier within the television industry now, sustaining career progression and achieving employment security is more of a challenge, particular for returning mothers (Willis and Dex, 1999: 7-9, 26). The workplace is becoming less regulated and most workers are not represented, while smaller independent companies tend to direct few resources towards personnel/human resource management and few have formalised equal opportunities policies (Willis and Dex, 1999: 7; Baehr, 1996: I, v). As Willis and Dex conclude, 'current modes of production and conditions of work are unlikely to encourage women with children to remain. It is likely that there will continue to be a talent and skills loss of women over 40' (Willis and Dex, 1999: 27). In the context of a general skills decline associated with the move to outsourcing, freelance and contract work in the media sector (see below), the impact of these factors on women employees is an industry-wide concern as much as an equity concern.

A greater majority of women working in television are freelances compared with men (British Film Institute, 1999: 18), so the media industries provide a useful case study in which to track the problems and opportunities such new working environments hold for women in the arts

and cultural industries. Measures aimed at improving income and conditions for women in the media industries would be relevant to - and could possibly act as a pilot for further measures aimed at - women self-employed/freelances working elsewhere in the arts and cultural sector.

Reasons for Moving to Freelance Work

What are the reasons women may choose to move into freelance work? While women working as freelances in broadcast media, film and video identify greater freedom and the possibility of redundancy as their main reasons for becoming freelance, they were also likely - much more so than men - to identify promotion and domestic/personal reasons (Woolf and Holly, 1995: vi). Yet paradoxically, women were less likely to be working part-time than men (Woolf and Holly, 1995: vi), indicating that maintaining a freelance career may demand full-time levels of work. Does this pattern lead to viable incomes for women?

Income Levels and Age

Women freelances were more likely to earn less than men in a Skillset study conducted in 1993-4 (Woolf and Holly, 1995: vii). This is probably the result of their age profile: seventy per cent of women freelances are under forty and this rises to more than eighty per cent of women producer/directors working freelance (Caple and Melbourne, 1997: 11). But the younger age profile of women in the media industries may *itself* be a symptom of the problems women have in developing and sustaining viable careers as freelances in the context of a largely unregulated workplace, flatter organisational structures and smaller business units without the 'ladders of progression' traditionally found in the more established work contexts, the multiplication of career entry points, and an increasing labour supply made up of young people who are willing to work for lower rates in order to gain a foothold (Willis and Dex, 1999: 7-8).

Short-term Contracts

The short-term contracts which are a feature of freelance work create both opportunities and problems. In the most recent television industry profile assembled by the British Film Institute, a majority of workers with experience of freelance or short term contracts indicated that as well as providing the flexibility to take time off between jobs, the mobility short-term contracts offer provides a varied range of experience and the context for skills development, and provides the networking possibilities that creates further freelancing opportunities. But a majority also confirmed that short-term contracts make income unpredictable and uneven, make career planning and finding new work difficult, they do not provide adequately for sick leave or maternity entitlement and the need to maintain continuous employment often leads to the acceptance of lower rates of pay. In fact, over half of freelances would prefer not to be working freelance (British Film Institute, 1999: 28-29). Clearly freelances achieve flexibility and skills and career development at the cost of employment security and control as well as loss of income, and within the television industry it is generally not a preferred career choice.

This picture sheds a new light on the higher number of women working as freelances. It may be that women's greater involvement in freelance work is a sign of disadvantage and lack of career choice in the television industry. Clearly they are significantly affected by the disadvantages listed above - in fact in greater proportions than male television workers. As a majority of freelances, they would be beneficiaries of measures designed to ameliorate the nega-

tive impact of the industry's reliance on short-term contracts, which it appears is disproportionately borne by the individual freelance worker.

Additionally, women freelancers are a particularly vulnerable sector of the female workforce; since networking and contacts are the most important means of obtaining work, women who break the continuity of their work as a result of maternity or other domestic responsibilities face a particular risk (Willis and Dex, 1999: 9). Additionally, Willis and Dex note that contract workers are an especially vulnerable group since they do not have access to the benefits of protected job maternity leave, which is a critical factor in minimising the effect having a family may have on income and career progression, as demonstrated by levels of seniority achieved. Also, difficulties in making firm childcare arrangements are created by not being able to predict working arrangements or income - especially with the unforeseen long working hours and after-hours work which are a feature of the sector (Willis and Dex 1999: 12-13). The conditions of contract workers, and the development of alternative forms of career support, are therefore of particular concern in the formation of a family-friendly employment policy.

As Baehr has indicated (1996: i-ii), a high proportion of independent companies do not have specific resources dedicated to personnel and human resources management, and hence are unlikely to initiate changes to the conditions of their contracts. Baehr's recommendation of a partnership between broadcasting organisations and their independent programme suppliers could here be adapted to develop best practice in providing better conditions for contract workers. European Commission contract standards as part of the policies governing European broadcasting organisations would encourage them to develop models of best practice through which to lead a partnership with the independent production companies.

Self-Employment: Opportunities for Sustainability

While some aspects of freelance work correspond to the disadvantages experienced by part-time workers, women also identify benefits in the patterns of freelance work, and Baehr recommends that the European Commission should encourage the entrepreneurship for female independent producers (Baehr, 1996: ii). Other research, into the new media industries, has indicated that women are more likely to develop sustainable careers and higher income levels if they are able to progress from freelance work to developing their own businesses (Swanson and Wise, 1998: 58-9), yet women working in the media are only half as likely as men to own their own company, and less than a third as likely to work only for their own company (Woolf and Holly, 1995: vi; British Film Institute, 1999: 7). Platforms for enterprise development, such as small business management and financial training and start-up investment funds, as well as information provision and networking support measures, are needed to aid women who wish to make this transition. This would build on the expertise women acquire from contract work, which sometimes allows them to exercise greater levels of responsibility (Gallagher, 1998: 9). Given Baehr's observation that women are more likely to progress to senior production positions in companies with women company directors (1996: iv), we could see these measures as benefiting women who gained work in female-headed companies as well as offering more women business opportunities and providing more role models.

4. Developing, Sustaining and Progressing Careers

As we have seen, women in the cultural sector are clustered in particular industry types – they are more prominent in libraries and less prominent in music, for example – and in particular kinds of jobs – they are more likely to be found in secretarial and administrative roles than men, and less likely to be found in creative or technical roles, even though the secretarial pathway has been found to be a particularly bad one in terms of career options (Milestone and Richards, 2000; Gallagher, 1998: 12, 17). Those areas where women predominate, such as wardrobe and make-up, research and production support are amongst the worst paid areas and women are not generally found in management positions (Woolf, Holly and Varlaam, 1994: vii; Gallagher, 1998: 26).

Some pathways for career development are declining. The increase of small independent production companies and the impact of smaller production budgets alongside changes in technology, means that the traditional means of skills formation through 'watching and learning' – which aids in the development of career pathways - are declining: for example assistant editors are now rarely used, and researchers are rarely retained during production or post-production phases, eliminating a key pathway through to director status (Kumari-Dass, 1997: 2). The impact of these changes to the industry structure on women's ability to develop pathways to senior level appointments needs to be tracked and analysed.

The pathway between administrative and creative or executive positions is of particular importance: women in administrative positions in the arts and cultural industries are likely to have had advanced qualifications and creative training and to continue their creative practice through freelance work (Swanson and Wise, 1998: 47, 123-29). However as a career development pathway, rather than as instance of diversification of profile, the pathway from administration into creative and executive roles appears weak, and even in the administrative area, women are found in very low numbers in the top half of the career 'ladder' (Gallagher, 1998: 15).

Additionally, it has been noted that while the multiskilled and team-based nature of new workplace practices corresponds to women's perception of their core skills (Milestone and Richards, 1999a; Swanson and Wise, 1999: 60-1), there is a risk that the full skills profile of employees will not be recognised and rewarded with pathways for career progression in working situations with less formalised career development pathways. In this context professional bodies with accreditation powers may play a particularly important role in ensuring that employees with broken career paths - or women who, for the range of reasons outlined, fail to have their expertise endorsed by a record of progress towards advanced employment categories - could provide a recognised assessment of their skills and professional profile.

Women in Technical Areas

Women are represented in particularly low numbers in the technical fields (British Film Institute, 1999: 16). While technical areas give those working in the industry a sound basis for sustained career development and a good income base - broadcast engineers, for example, are 'white, male, well educated, relatively highly paid, and permanently employed' – the media industries continue to experience difficulties in attracting female recruits to their technical workforce (Woolf, Holly and Connor, 1996: vii, 81).

Technical training and employment is a good basis for women involved in this area of work to maintain and develop a career in the cultural sector, particularly in the context of increased outsourcing: not only were women technical freelances more likely to be in employment than women freelances in other areas, and to be employed on long term contracts, but nearly a quarter of women technical freelances had their own company, a higher proportion than for freelances in all other skill groups except producers/directors (Woolf and Holly, 1995: 62). Also, the technical area offers considerable scope for promotion to higher technical positions, as well as giving opportunities to move into production (Gallagher, 1998: 24). Women are particularly badly represented as editors, at 17% of total employees in this area, yet editors are given a high status and earn high levels of income in the UK (Gallagher, 1998: 27). However, it appears that the overlap between technical and production work in radio allows greater opportunities for women to move into these areas and to gain access to creative roles (Gallagher, 1998: 24). Although women appear in smaller numbers in these areas, then, for those women working in technical capacities it provides good opportunities, so women's entry and development of professional careers in the technical areas should comprise a target group for future change and policy focus.

Young women appear to be changing some of the above patterns: they are beginning to move into traditionally male dominated areas of music and working in creative technology in the music industry, and are developing greater technical skill profiles in multimedia (Milestone and Richards, 1999b; Swanson and Wise, 1999: 60)¹⁹⁵. This may reflect a changing attitude towards gender segregation in the industry, since women working as technical freelances in the media sector are particularly likely to have entered the industry later (Woolf and Holly, 1995: vi). However, given that women appear to leave the media industries after the age of 40 (Woolf and Holly, 1995: 62, v), attention needs to be given to ensure that early patterns of participation are sustained throughout careers, despite changing responsibilities following childbirth for example, or as a result of the availability of better career options outside the cultural sector. These could include management or executive roles, which are less difficult to sustain than the demands of location work for example. They may provide a more attractive option for mid-career professional women and prevent the skills loss that is currently occurring in many cultural industries. As research in the multimedia industries shows, the multi-skilling demanded by team-based work, and the skills development opportunities of a varied range of freelance work situations and packages¹⁹⁶, allow more women to become technically proficient at some level, but there are still difficulties in developing those more specialised technical skills profiles which enable them to build specialist technically oriented careers (Swanson and Wise, 1999: 61).

Women in the Career Hierarchy: Producers/Directors in the Media Industries

Generally, men have occupied the higher positions in production and direction roles. In 1995, a Skillset survey found that two thirds or more of producers/directors and those in post production in the media sector were men, while almost two thirds of those in production support were women (Woolf and Holly, 1995: v). Baehr's research in the independent sector confirms that women are clustered at lower levels of the production hierarchy with men occupying the

¹⁹⁵ While women comprise a much greater proportion of the membership of the musician's union in the lower age groups it remains to be seen whether this is due to a drop-off during their 20s and 30s, or a transformation which will be sustained as this cohort moves through their careers.

¹⁹⁶ Freelance work packages indicates that the person puts together a "package" of varied types of work, either done simultaneously or sequentially, giving them experience in different kinds of work and thus developing a more varied array of skills.

major decision-making positions - 88% of the lower-level production support jobs were filled by women¹⁹⁷. However, established broadcasters do better in employing women in executive production roles than the newer independent companies, though this may be due to the better opportunities for internal career progression afforded by larger organisations (Gallagher, 1998: 23; Kumari-Dass, 1997: 24).

But greater proportions of women are presently working as television producers and directors than those of men, according to the BFI television industry tracking study (British Film Institute, 1999: 16; Baehr, 1996: i, iii, 53). Baehr also found that women did better as producers than they did as directors – while women were 52% of producers, 76% of directors were men, reflecting the different pathways to these roles and the lack of women in technical positions (Baehr, 1996: iii).

Much greater proportions of women than men work in production support/research/clerical roles and smaller proportions than men work in managerial and executive production roles. While it appears that during the past four years the proportions of women employed in higher managerial and executive production categories increased, the proportion of men increased in greater numbers. At the same time, however, proportions of men and women in lower production support levels *both* decreased (British Film Institute, 1999: 17). This suggests that although greater proportions of women may be moving towards higher levels or positions, the power of these positions within the hierarchy is itself changing.

Kumari-Dass indicates that a practice of 'grade jumping' - promotion to a higher position to 'learn on the job' - has come to replace the provision of training before taking up more advanced positions in the production hierarchy. In a knock-on effect, this has led to a loss of expertise and skills specialisation throughout the grades, from production assistant through to producers and directors. As a result, it has become standard practice for those in more senior grades to absorb the responsibilities of those untrained staff occupying positions below them, and consequently, a critical skills deficit is emerging. Kumari-Dass paints a picture in which producers in particular are becoming less experienced and are even seen as unqualified and less capable: in this context the producer has little discretion or control over content, and the Head of Production and Head of Development roles become increasingly important (Kumari-Dass, 1997: 6). In the light of these observations, the greater number of women taking up the role of producer is perhaps a sign of the deskilling of this level in the production hierarchy and we should be more concerned with the failure of women to progress to higher executive and managerial positions. This finding, drawn from the interviews Kumari-Dass uses as the basis of her report, indicates the importance of qualitative research in providing a framework with which to interpret quantitative data and statistical indicators.

This situation creates a polarisation of the career hierarchy, comprising a flattening out of the production team grades with much more power residing in top executive roles. Such a 'missing middle' in the production hierarchy suggests that women's better record in becoming employed as producers has a sting in the tail: not only may this be a reflection of a lower status and power being given to producers, but without established pathways for progression it will be more difficult for women to progress beyond producer level to those senior roles which have taken over many of the roles and much of the power of the producer.

¹⁹⁷ As the lower production support roles, Baehr includes Production Co-ordinator, Production Supervisor /Manager, Production Assistant and Production Secretary (1996: 53).

Women in Top Jobs

In general, women in the labour market remain confined to a narrower range of job levels, and have proportionately fewer members in the higher job categories¹⁹⁸. Women remain markedly under-represented in the higher jobs within cultural industries and cultural occupations compared with men (LFS Winter 1998-9). In the cultural industries, male employees are more than twice as likely as females to be found in professional or managerial jobs. In particular, the disparity between men and women appears to be marked in the publishing and recorded media sector, where 62 per cent of men are found in professional/ managerial jobs compared to just 28 per cent of women. Looking at cultural occupations, the disparity in job levels is less marked, but is still clearly evident, with male employees in cultural occupations about 33 per cent more likely than their female counterparts to be found in the professional/managerial jobs. Source: LFS Winter 1998/99 UK

Women in Decision-Making Roles

The Arts Council carries out annual surveys of its funded organisations and monitors a range of performance indicators, some of which include equal opportunities matters (Arts Council of England, 1998). In recent years the Arts Council has collected information on the gender composition of the permanent staffing and boards/management committees of these organisations. Although these organisations cover only small part of the total sector, they represent a significant part of the total funded sector¹⁹⁹.

In terms of job levels, women remain significantly under-represented on the management boards of many funded organisations. In 1997/98, only 39 per cent of the management committee membership of arts council funded organisations were women. There was again considerable sectoral variation. In dance companies, just over half the board membership were women, with the lowest proportion again in music organisations, with only a quarter of their management boards being accounted for by women (Arts Council of England, 1998).

Data on the gender make-up of the main advisory panels of the Arts Council of England, the Scottish Arts Council, the West Midlands Arts Board and the London Arts Board indicates that although men were in the majority overall, the difference was not great, and in the West Midlands and London women outnumbered men on advisory boards. (Source: Annual Reports 1998/99.)

More generally, the gender of chairs and vice-chairs of the various national and regional arts councils/boards, and for a number of opera, ballet, theatre and film companies, shows a quite striking predominance of male chairs among arts boards/councils and other artistic organisations. Out of those organisations contacted, only one female chair was identified out of a total of 19. Women accounted for less than a third of total membership.

Baehr's (1996) study examined the position of women in the production side of the independent television sector in Britain and the Netherlands. Women were more likely to be Company Directors of smaller companies (in terms of turnover). Although the research found that women employees tended to fare better in companies where women took up a higher propor-

¹⁹⁸ This analysis relates to employees only and is limited to a very broad consideration of non-manual job levels, considering only the proportion of employees found in the top socio-economic group, Employers, Managers and Professionals. This is because sample sizes within the LFS prevent more detailed analysis.

¹⁹⁹ Arts Council PIs account for a total permanent staffing employment of 8,571.

tion of senior decision-making posts, the gender of company directors had little influence on the provision of flexible working arrangements or other 'family friendly' benefits. The majority of companies reported that they had equal opportunities policies, but admitted that these were unwritten and informal.

Management Roles

The persistence of women's difficulty in progressing to senior management and professional positions in the arts and cultural industries is of particular concern, even more so in areas of work which are dependent on less formal recruitment and promotion processes. The levels and amounts of work attracted by those working in contract positions and as freelancers, is critically dependent upon those working in senior management, and as curators and artistic directors etc, in similar ways to the 'gatekeepers' identified in the music industry. Baehr notes that women working as freelance/self-employed did better in companies headed by women (1996: iv).

In the labour force generally, women are becoming significantly more involved in the top categories, but this category consists of professional jobs (lawyers, accountants, doctors etc) plus senior managers. It seems that much of the overall improvement of women in the top category is due to a growth in the former (women in professional jobs) rather than in the latter (women in senior management jobs) and women are still less likely to progress to senior management positions (Thair and Risdon, 1999).

This trend is replicated in the cultural industries: women are much less likely to occupy senior positions than men, and find it difficult to gain access to formal management-related skills learning programmes (Gallagher, 1998: 43; Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995: ii-iv). While women may often take on more senior levels of responsibility, these are sometimes incorporated into a role which is paid and graded at a lower level, and they often are not rewarded with ongoing career progression, particularly if they are working in contract positions (Milestone and Richards, 2000; Willis and Dex, 1999: 9; Gallagher, 1998: 8).

There is some variation and signs of progress which can be perceived: Gallagher found that the established broadcasters, such as Granada, Channel 4 and the BBC, which offer internal career ladders and EO policies, are more likely to appoint women to the top decision-making and highest paid positions (Gallagher, 1998: 23). LWT recently won an Opportunity 2000 award for work in relation to women in management, and the proportion of women in senior management in the BBC is increasing: with women as 31% of senior executives and 33% of senior management (Independent Television Commission, 1998: 100; Department of Culture, Media and Sport, 1998b: 105; BBC, 1999: 1).

However, the picture is not all improving and the impact of women on central decision-making gives less reason for optimism. The Independent Television Commission acknowledges that numbers of women at board and senior management levels are low overall and in some cases have decreased (Independent Television Commission, 1998: 100; Anderson, 1998: 27). While Baehr found that women had greater access to senior decision-making positions in the independent television production sector than in broadcasting organisations, only three of the 17 people working at board level, and only one of the seven Managing Directors in the companies she surveyed were women (Baehr, 1996: iv, vi). Although women are growing as members of internal management committees of broadcasting organisations, they do so from a very low base – and they still tend to do somewhat better in their representation

on *external* governing boards than internally, in *employment-based* – and more influential - decision-making capacities (Gallagher, 1998: 43).

Gatekeepers and Promotion

Some studies have pointed to the powerful position of gatekeepers in the selection of products within the cultural industries. Negus's (1992) assessment of the British pop music business identified the important role played by gatekeepers in selecting which artists are first signed and then subsequently promoted. His study highlighted the influential role the Artist and Repertoire (A & R) managers play in shaping the output of the pop music business, and in particular, the fact that this group of individuals largely consists of white males. Negus suggests that successful artists in the British rock and pop field reflect the general background of the A and R managers. In turn it has been suggested that this has created a gender imbalance in the selection and promotion of artists.

Awards and Prizes

One important source of publicity and influence in some areas of the cultural sector are prestigious prizes or awards. Although little data is available, what there is suggests that men strongly outnumber women among prize winners for some awards. For example, the Whitbread book awards have, since 1971 awarded 93 prizes to male writers, compared with 41 prizes to female writers. The Booker prize has been won 21 times by male writers compared to 11 times for women.

5. Qualifications, Training and Professional Development

Qualifications

In all occupational categories, women are more likely than men to hold higher artistic qualifications. However, there is little difference in these proportions between male and female visual artists, commercial artists etc. The difference is most marked in the industrial designers and musicians groups. In the latter group, women are over twice as likely to hold higher artistic qualifications. (Source: 1991 Census.)

Table 6 shows breakdowns for all UK-domiciled higher education students studying for library-related, or creative arts and design subjects.

Table 6: UK domiciled students in higher education institutions studying creative arts and design subjects or library/communication subjects

Subject	Total	Women	
		Total	%
Creative arts & design	84,050	47,769	57
Fine art	13,833	8,120	59
Design studies	38,117	20,792	55
Music	11,803	6,223	53
Drama	10,239	6,968	68
Cinematics	3,724	1,526	41
Crafts	313	271	87
Beauty and hairdressing	71	67	94
Other art and design	4,906	3,149	64
Combinations of the above	1,044	653	63
Librarianship and information science	18,168	11,075	61
Librarianship	961	660	69
Information science	3,794	2,384	63
Communication studies	4,389	2,916	66
Media studies	6,014	3,371	56
Publishing	310	196	63
Journalism	2,270	1,237	54
Combinations of above	430	311	72

Source: Higher Education Funding Agency 1997/98.

Traditionally, female students in higher education have been somewhat over-represented in the creative arts subjects. The most recent figures suggest that this continues to be the case, although there is significant variation between specific subjects (*Table 6*). Women outnumber men in the creative arts and design subjects, accounting for 57 per cent of students in this sector. This pattern is more pronounced in the librarianship and information science sector, where 61 per cent of higher education students are women. Drama, crafts, beauty and hairdressing, librarianship and communication studies stand out as particularly 'female' subjects in terms of numbers of students: at least two thirds of the total number of students in these subjects are women, and this rises to 87 and 94 per cent in crafts and beauty/hairdressing respectively. There is more of a gender balance in music and journalism, while the only subject within these broad categories where men are in the majority is cinematics, where only 41 per cent of students are women.

Adaptive Training

While women working in the cultural industries are more highly qualified and trained than their male peers in general, they are also more likely to have received recent training – patterns which suggest a disposition amongst women to adopt training routes for purposes of career development and progression (Woolf, Holly and Varlaam, 1995: vii). Many of the problems for women's pathways and progression in the cultural industries noted in this report could be addressed through the provision of relevant and adaptive education, training and professional development packages, with more targeted provision and delivery of training.

The adoption of new technologies across the cultural sector makes the need to update and adapt existing expertise on an ongoing basis particularly graphic, but the importance of en-

sure that skills and expertise profiles are responsive to industry practice as well as social and cultural changes is more general and should be addressed at earlier stages. It has been found that the commitment to a career in the visual arts starts in the early to mid-teens, while the patterns for a drop-off of involvement in music amongst girls also develops in this period (Honey, Heron and Jackson, 1997: 22). The development of creative potential and new forms of literacy, and the development of more positive attitudes to the suitability of careers in the cultural industries for women, needs to be addressed at school age and demands a significant revision of the core curriculum to incorporate creative and cultural education, and new partnerships between schools and organisations and individuals working in the cultural and creative industries, as in the recent report *All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education* (National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education, 1999: 6-15; Milestone and Richards, 1999a). Thus questions of education, training and professional development demand tailored strategies and policy commitments across the education, training and employment spectrum.

The government-commissioned *Cultural Industry Mapping Document* has highlighted the importance of relevant and adaptive training for growth across the full range of creative industries (Department of Culture, Media and Sport, 1998). However, there is still evidence of a lack of fit between higher education providers and industry need, a chronic lack of ongoing investment by industry itself and a lack of progress in developing effective partnerships to develop appropriate training content and delivery (Kumari-Dass, 1997: 3-4; Caple and Melbourne, 1997: 7).

Skills Deficits and Investment in Training

Commentators have in particular identified the increasing problem of a skills deficit in the media sector which is emerging as an effect of outsourcing production to smaller, independent production companies, a *casualisation*²⁰⁰ of the workforce, and an associated erosion in training provision, impacting upon individual career development patterns (Woolf, Holly and Varlaam, 1994: iii-iv; Kumari-Dass, 1997: 17; Caple and Melbourne, 1997: 11). Some of these skills deficits appear in traditionally female areas of employment, such as production management (Kumari-Dass, 1997: 2), putting women's ability to progress to higher positions at risk if this pattern of reduced training provision and skills decline continues. Collaboration between broadcasters and independent companies will be needed to provide a co-ordinated approach to training investment, which could entail the mandatory inclusion of traineeships in budgets (Kumari-Dass, 1997: 26). This could improve the chances of accessing training by women working as freelancers, if the broadcasting organisations were instrumental in ensuring that the EO policies they are governed by were adopted in the recruitment of trainees.

Skills shortages also appear in the new media industries, such as in software development, which suggests that the development of relevant, high quality and accessible training should be treated as a priority if the 'huge potential' for growth and the possibility of sustainable employment are not to be lost (Department of Culture, Media and Sport, 1998: 97; Digital Media Alliance Steering Group, 1998: 22). To date, government and industry have collaborated to provide 'envisioning' statements, and the industry bodies which characterise this sector have not yet started to accumulate detailed data on the companies and individuals which make up

²⁰⁰ The move to employ short term contract staff (often paid hourly rates according to how much work there is) which means giving them none of the benefits of permanent employees and not taking the risk of having employees on salary rolls if the company doesn't have enough work to give them, thus reducing employment costs. They are often referred to as "casuals" or "casual staff".

this rapidly growing sector. Yet in September 1998 it was estimated that there were 2,750 UK companies operating in digital media, and 2,000 freelancers or sole traders working in this sector, showing a need for concerted training provision that intersects with industry development objectives (Digital Media Alliance Steering Group, 1998: 21).

Moreover, new forms of content development afforded by digital technologies indicates that there will be skill needs in the newer areas of existing cultural professions, as they adapt to the digital workplace. The library sector has shown a particular interest in strategic planning in the use of information technology skills that will be used in new contexts for knowledge management (TFPL, 1999). However, the lack of any detailed profile and analysis of new media industry structure, patterns and need, is of particular concern in the light of the recognition of an urgent need for planning the adaptation to new media and communications technologies in the cultural sector (Swanson and Wise, 1999: 65). As yet it appears that graduate and postgraduate training is developing on an *ad hoc* basis with little evidence of industry or industry advisory body input on curriculum development or the monitoring of standards (Placca and Smith, 1996: 11-12).

Multiskilling

While multiskilling is demanded by the move to smaller units with team-based production processes, and is an outcome of the mobility of a freelance workforce, it has been pointed out that it remains untested and thus requires more concerted attention to ways of ensuring that it is achieved to appropriate levels of competence (Caple and Melbourne, 1997: 11). Additionally, there still remains a strong need for specialist expertise – across technical, creative and production classifications - to ensure a supply of high quality personnel and guarantee content quality and efficiency. The availability and accessibility of well-designed packages incorporating best-practice models of multiskilling, high level specialist training and the formation of employment pathways that allow the accumulation of relevant experience is clearly critical for women forming careers in the cultural sector. This demands ongoing evaluation of training provision on a sectoral basis, as well as of skills needs.

The provision of effective and accessible, industry-responsive, training programs is partly a measure designed to enhance the positions reached by women working in the arts and cultural industries, but also one which relates to the general ability of employees to retain professional viability, adaptability and mobility, especially in a sector increasingly reliant on outsourcing and thus with fewer in-house training schemes. Ensuring expertise is matched to industry needs is a critical factor in making flexibility work *for* women rather than it being seen - as in other industries - as a disempowering factor.

But within the cultural sector, formal training is only one part of the equation: personal recommendation, peer assessment, and the ability to compile a 'portfolio' profile of experience and testimony is at least as significant in accessing work and pathways towards obtaining higher level appointments. It is particularly difficult to demonstrate and assess levels of expertise, competence or successful performance in arts professions by reference to formal training completion and qualifications. The development of innovative models for assessing, auditing and accrediting skills and experience levels, and enabling their 'transferability' between positions and sectors is important to enable mobility and ensure that the experience that women gain is rendered legible, especially if they have non-traditional career patterns (Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995: v).

New Environments and Entrepreneurial Skills for the Arts

Changes in the cultural workplace have brought entrepreneurial skills to the fore, while some areas, such as visual arts, have always been characterised by a fragmented labour market, and so it has been suggested that the career success of some artists shows a need for networking skills, business management, presentation skills and knowledge of the workplace/market etc to become more generally held. These have been undervalued in the arts sector, as they have been seen as skills for operating in a commercial environment and therefore as associated with practices which stifle innovation (Honey, Heron and Jackson, 1997: 100-2). A recent survey found that 'a large number of artists have a low level of interest in or awareness of the business side of their profession', despite having a very low level of income generated by their work: 'Many artists will work for very little, for nothing and even at a loss to have their work shown'. This is understood to reinforce a lack status amongst artists and to undermine their bargaining power in a competitive marketplace, and in addition to a number of recommendations to instigate professional standards and a code of practice concerning the contracting and payment of artists. Researchers recommend that 'colleges and other training providers (should) increase artists' awareness of and skills in the business side of their profession' (Shaw and Allen, 1997: 35-7).

It is now more widely accepted that such skills are an essential part of the repertoire of arts and cultural workers, and that the 'appropriate balance of skills and competencies...dictates, in general, the employment opportunities available to a student' (Birch, Jackson and Towse, 1998: 62). The flow of labour between commercial and not-for-profit sectors indicates that many artists and those in other cultural occupations are developing these through experience, but they are still not widely included as part of higher education training in the arts or as professional development platforms for those working in many professional arts contexts. Recent research has led to a more strategic and encompassing approach to training, with one report recommending:

training providers, representative organisations, education funding councils, accrediting bodies and the NTO, should consider training within a wider framework of pre- and post-vocational training provision, career development and skill maintenance opportunities; with the objective of ensuring maximum accessibility, congruence and appropriate training routes for progression

(Birch, Jackson and Towse, 1998: 77).

As overseas research shows, women working in the arts and cultural industries actively identify industry-oriented kinds of training as part of their own career development needs, alongside the need for more systematic industry information provision to provide them with access to industry knowledge (Swanson and Wise, 1998: 150-2). However, they need to be delivered in ways which women can access readily and which are suited to their existing package of work and family life: short, focussed, industry-responsive courses rather than certified higher education programmes appear to be more suited to women across the range of their career stages, along with postgraduate programs for those who target work in ongoing employment contexts (Swanson and Wise, 1999: 61).

Partnerships are seen as a necessary part of media and new media industry development, identifying clearly focussed training needs rather than just expanding the range of those trained. But they are also needed to ensure that those working in the arts have equality of opportunity - not just in accessing specialised arts training, but also in developing their profiles

and networks, marketing their product, planning and progressing their careers, identifying new opportunities for work and managing their freelance work or their own business.

Partnerships and Co-ordination

Many have pointed out the need for partnerships between industry, unions and training providers, in order to ensure that training is relevant and matched to industry needs and new developments as well as to increase the level of investment in training, which is currently very low (Caple and Melbourne, 1997: 15-19). Broadcast journalism, which appears to have no skill shortage problem, can be used as a useful best practice model here, especially as it offers a context in which there is a more equal distribution of men and women than in many occupational areas in the media industries. There is a widespread pattern of well paid and permanent employment in broadcast journalism, and 'a ladder of progression from specifically focussed higher education to entry into the industry is clearly discernible and apparently effective'. There is also a culture of ongoing investment in training and skills updating for broadcast journalists which includes employer-provided and financed courses, although there are still signs that the small number of freelancers are not receiving the same levels of support (Woolf, Holly and Connor, 1996: vi). It has been suggested that the existence of industry accrediting bodies which co-ordinate partnerships between employers, unions and higher education and which provide 'dialogue, understanding and the maintenance of standards' is a critical factor in this successful articulation between industry need and training provision (Woolf, Holly and Connor, 1996: iii). The existence of specific industry bodies designed to manage such partnerships would help to set training and experience standards to ensure that skills formation and employment grades were properly matched (Kumari-Dass, 1997: 27), and could ensure that provision is made for staff with particular needs, for example so that those employed on short term contract or freelance basis may be offered opportunities for on-the-job training support as well as for financing of training courses, the preferred option of freelancers (Caple and Melbourne, 1997: *Tables 25-6*).²⁰¹

6. Professional and Policy Strategies

A Policy Gap

The European Commission Working Paper *Culture, the Cultural Industries and Employment* (1998) highlights the strengthening of equal opportunity policies aimed at balancing work and family life, and an increase of employment rates for women as 'mainstream' components of its strategy for gaining economic competitiveness and ensuring social inclusiveness within the European Union. Within the UK context, however, it is less easy to see a concerted interest in equity issues, or in addressing women within the cultural sector at the national level. Indicatively, the *Creative Industries Mapping Document* (DCMS, 1998b) identifies no issue relating to the contribution of women as part of its strategy for working for growth or quality enhancement, and has only the most gestural observations concerning women's employment and patterns, while the only social group addressed in the DCMS 1998 *Annual Report* is that of young people. Research conducted by the Arts Council of Great Britain in 1993, specifically focussed on strategies to promote women's involvement in the arts sector has not been followed up, or replicated by other bodies with national remit. While the Arts Council of Eng-

²⁰¹ In addition to Skillset, which has, for example a Freelance Training Fund, it is suggested that narrowly focussed industry accreditation bodies such as those which operate in the area of broadcast journalism could have more concrete and targeted impacts.

land's strategic priority of 'diversity and inclusion' aims to include women, it now no longer has 'women in arts' as a designated area of responsibility and the most recent published documents issued under the rubric of 'cultural diversity' specifically address black and Asian arts only.

The Policy Action Team 10's report to the Social Exclusion Unit (1999) – which is focused on maximising the impact of spending and policies on arts, sport and leisure in poor neighbourhoods and for groups who are socially excluded irrespective of geographic location – identifies 'ethnic minority groups and disabled people' as target groups for the arts and only includes women as a target group for sport. Even in educational policy, girls' needs are not identified as part of the process of tailoring support in ways which recognise diversity as it relates to gender. The recent report *All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education* (National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education, 1999), provides the context for a partnership between the Department for Employment and Education and the Department for Culture, Media and Sport by integrating the principles of a creative education ('forms of education that develop young people's capacities for original ideas and action') and a cultural education ('forms of education that enable them to engage positively with the growing complexity and diversity of social values and ways of life') into the core curriculum. However, there is no special attention given to improving the performance of girls (who outperform boys until a drop-off in the teenage years), or of the particularly compelling impact that social difference may have on girls, or of the importance of equipping them for participation in those industries which are so obviously presently inhospitable to their creative involvement, such as music.

It seems that women and girls fall out of sight of the policy lens across the spectrum of those cultural policy initiatives which adopt diversity as their template. Similarly, while the critical areas identified by the cross-cutting interdepartmental brief of the mainstreaming 'watchdog', the Women's Unit – such education, economy, employment, and women in decision-making – interface with the cultural industries, in a world of limited resources the priorities for the Unit are likely to be the 'harder' issues of women and violence, poverty, health, etc (see summary of government measures to aid women' www.womens-unit.gov.uk). While mainstreaming – and aligning equity for women with other groups through models of diversity - avoids the 'ghettoising' of 'women's policies, it appears that the concerns of women must be reintegrated into the UK cultural policy domain. A relationship needs to be articulated between equity, diversity and social exclusion policies in ways which inform those new forms of attention being given to creative industries, community cultural planning, and employment and education platforms.

Economic and Industrial Factors as Critical Components of Equity Platforms

In the light of a changing policy and industry development landscape, it seems that a reframing of equity approaches is in order, assessing the impact of previous models and considering those new frameworks which should be used for approaching issues of gender. While equity platforms addressing women are oriented by social and cultural needs for inclusiveness, they are also driven by economic and industrial factors. Women comprise an important component of those resources which may be marshalled to respond to global technological and industrial changes, and as a growing proportion of the labour force will be critical in helping to adapt to changes in the pattern of work.

The trends outlined in this paper show just how much the work environment is changing, and how we need to develop professional and policy strategies which are responsive to these changes. Growth will take place in 'traditionally' female jobs (including non-manual occupations, the service sector and in part-time work) and there will be a particular increase in labour force participation amongst women with children (Thair and Risdon, 1999; Payne, 1995; Department for Education and Employment, 1997). These trends point to an increasing feminisation of employment in those sectors which are experiencing growth, which includes the arts and cultural industries sector. They also point to the need to create more family-friendly work environments and working patterns which allow greater balance between work and family responsibilities.

This provides a compelling reason to ensure that there is

- adequate knowledge about the patterns of women working in the sector, through targeted sectoral and inter-sectoral research; and
- a coherent set of policy objectives and measures aimed at ensuring women are realising their full potential to contribute to this sector and that conditions are hospitable to women's participation, allowing them access to appropriate forms of training, employment and income.

A key to such reframing is to consider women as *a resource in gaining greater competitiveness*, as the more effective use of their input, skills and expertise can help to create more efficient industries. *Economic and industrial factors* offer a critical dimension to the framing of equity policy, alongside women's *social rights* to equal treatment in the workplace and to develop successful and well-rewarded careers, and the *cultural dimension* of creating inclusiveness and diversity.

In general, while there will be different emphases for different sectors and job types, the policy measures and research needs identified to address women's careers need to be formulated in terms of:

- entry into and the development of pathways between, professional employment contexts in the arts and cultural sector;
- career progression and the ability to ascend career hierarchies;
- sustainability of careers, considering the age profile of employment types and women returning following childbirth or a break in career.

Industry Development and Women's Employment and Training in the Cultural Sector

There is a lack of connection being made between employment and training policy, and policy relating to the cultural sector, yet cultural industry development objectives are in general synergistic with objectives concerning the enhancement of women's opportunities for more sustainable careers in the cultural sector.

Relevant and responsive training provision, the effective deployment of their human resources, and the support of career development pathways and strategies for those working in the creative professions will improve both the quality and efficiency of the creative industries, and the opportunities and employment platforms available to individuals. Women's situation in these industries may be partly created by attitudinal problems, but they are also created by

a lack of formal mechanisms for recruitment, gaining experience, career advancement, etc. Procedures designed to systematise the operations and practices relating to these kinds of employment - facilitating entry and progression, developing skills on an ongoing basis, creating opportunities to gain management-related or higher level creative or production experience, the auditing of skills and experience levels etc - will provide a platform from which women are able to access a greater range of measures to support their career development and render their skills and experience legible. Ensuring high quality training is available to maintain and develop the skills base of the cultural industries in a changing environment will be a critical element in achieving growth, and since women are more likely to be highly trained than men will impact upon the quality of their skills and expertise, and provide better portfolios to support their entry and progression. Training and employment measures will have to be adapted and tailored to the patterns and practices of the cultural industries as a working context.

Family Friendly Policies Should be Integrated into the Cultural Sector

There are several areas which warrant particular attention in developing mechanisms which would aid women take up more senior management roles as well as in progressing to higher grades of employment and income levels. The persistence of career setbacks experienced by women with family responsibilities or who take time out of work for childbirth is very significant (see especially Willis and Dex, 1999; Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995 i-v). This indicates a striking failure of equal opportunities policies and programmes over a long period: a failure to instigate a workplace culture that recognises and adapts to the most basic and widespread constraints on female employees and their potential need to develop a distinctive career lifecycle. Clearly, there is a need for 'family friendly policies' to be integrated into the cultural sector, even in those areas which are characterised by high levels of female employment and hence often thought to be more hospitable to their career progression and to offer more secure employment and income levels. While women may do better in these employment contexts than in male dominated industries, such as music, it seems that a greater number of women being employed in a sector does not fully constitute 'feminisation' in the most positive sense of the word.

There is a clear need to identify policies and mechanisms which recognise the impact of family responsibilities on women's careers, and which allow them to return after career breaks or periods working part-time without suffering a permanent setback to their career plans, and to create, in some cases, a work culture which is not actively hostile to women's family roles. These require particular workplace-related programs which target parents' working patterns, constraints and needs, offering employment re-entry programs, and platforms designed to maintain skills development, a varied pattern of experience, and the ability to accelerate career development while working part-time.

There are also less visible mechanisms of disadvantage for working parents. Early meetings and unpredictable or after hours working and networking activities appear to pose significant obstacles to women with families taking up executive and higher management roles (Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995: ii, iv; Willis and Dex, 1999: 10; Milestone, 1999). Clearly, meeting and networking practices need to be formalised in ways which allow women with family responsibilities adequate time to plan effectively and thereby enable them to maintain a full involvement in the whole range of workplace activities which are associated with promotion to senior levels.

Inflexibility of working hours and conditions is a key factor in this context (Willis and Dex, 1999; Poland, Curran and Owens, 1995: i-v), and the cultural sector could seek models in the instigation of more flexible working practices in many other industry types. In their study of barriers to women reaching senior management positions in the library sector, Poland, Curran and Owens urge measures to 'encourage more flexible working conditions such as job sharing; term time working; flexitime and other ways of working *which facilitate career development alongside caring responsibilities* without adversely affecting services' (1995: iv, our emphasis). The connection they make between the ability of women to pursue high level career development and the tailoring of these measures to enable women to progress is important: it is not enough to provide flexibility only to the extent that women are able to enter and maintain employment, they need instead to be provided in ways that allow women to work to their full potential and reach their career goals. The ability of a greater range of women to reach senior management and decision-making positions is critical to changing the culture of the workplace and influencing the employment prospects and viability of women employed throughout the cultural industries.

Women's Lower Income Levels Should be Addressed to Ensure that Qualified and Experienced Women do not Leave the Cultural Sector

Clearly income levels are a priority equity issue for women in the arts and cultural industries yet they are unevenly mapped in the recent DCMS *Creative Industries Mapping Document* and they do not feature at all amongst the issues identified in the development of the sector as they are not understood to impact upon industry growth: yet lower income levels may point to an under-utilisation of the female workforce in these sectors. If this is the case, adjusting industry and work practices to enhance women's contribution would lead to greater efficiency and carry potential for further growth. Further research is needed on patterns of women's income levels and growth across sectors, the reasons for the levels of disparity and the effect of these patterns on the retention of women as a component of the industries' skilled workforce. The difficulty of deriving a clear sectoral picture of income levels, growth and gender disparity – especially one which includes the self-employed - may also suggest a need to devise different types of statistical classification which are correlated against employment and career features.

Education and Social Exclusion Programmes Should be Informed by the Gendered Patterns of Participation in the Cultural Industries and Tailored to the Problems Facing Girls

Educational agendas directed at improving the creative and cultural aspect of the core curriculum should consider ways of enhancing the performance of girls and women in traditionally male areas of the cultural industries, as these patterns are established during school years, in order to improve the contribution of women across the full range of job and industry types in the cultural sector.

Additionally, some *social exclusion* issues concerning girls may be addressed through programmes which harness girls' greater involvement and better performance in the arts and cultural areas, to enhance their self-esteem, to allow them to demonstrate their skills, capabilities and creative potential, to identify aspirations and goals and to help them achieve their full potential.

Diversity Policies and Models for Management of Diversity Should Include Gender

Equity and diversity policies should not be seen as alternatives. In fact, diversity management models include the management of gender diversity, although the measures developed would be different for women than for those of ethnicity and disability. However, research suggests a continuing lack of diversity regarding gender in the management arrangements of cultural and media organisations, one that has implications for accessibility, relevance and quality.

The 'management for diversity' model identifies a need to draw upon a more diverse pool of managerial talent, reflecting the diversity of the population. This has creative outcomes concerning production processes and content generation, as products benefit from a richer array of qualities and inputs, and so the adoption of such a model has economic implications and content quality outcomes, as well as those of social equity outcomes. The social and cultural benefits of diversity for cultural industry development are also a central platform of the Report of the World Commission on Cultural Development, *Our Creative Diversity* (1995). However, the cultural sector has yet to act upon this widely accepted principle of modern industrial efficiency, and to build on the array of expertise that women offer.

The arts and cultural sector benefits from a high level of input of women, and so does not need to increase the contribution of women *per se* to reach a good overall gender breakdown, but there are other questions surrounding the participation of women which need to be addressed, since our research shows that although they have been identified for some years, they have still not been resolved. These include questions relating to the range of women who are able to participate; the lower levels of income gained by women throughout the cultural industries; the younger age profile of women working in the cultural professions and the difficulties women with career breaks or family responsibilities have sustaining careers; the difficulties women have in accessing senior management, creative and production positions; the lower levels of income and security experienced by women freelancers; the gendered profile of different job types, especially the lack of women in higher paid areas, including technical professionals.

With significant numbers of mid-career professional women finding pathways from other industries, the new media sector in particular could become a leadership sector in developing innovative management programmes and styles suited to new working patterns and women's distinctive needs in career development, enabling them to build on the potential women have for making a higher level contribution to decision-making and strategic planning. For example, mentoring programs and attachments for women moving towards senior levels may offer an opportunity to profile their expertise and qualities to those in influential positions in addition to providing a tailored career development and learning program. The lessons learnt from such initiatives – and the benefits pilot programmes would demonstrate – could be adapted throughout the cultural sector, in ways relevant to the range of industry types and management needs.

Employment and Equity Initiatives Concerning Women Should Not Overlook Their Involvement in the Cultural Industries

The representation of women in the media is one area of concern that has been identified by the UN *Global Platform for Action*, 1995, and the UK government programme 'Delivering to Women'. However, issues concerning women cannot be addressed without also considering the dynamics of those industries which produce such representations, and especially the posi-

tion of women in senior decision-making positions. It is also important to include more than the media: apart from expanding the focus of representations to encompass the range of forms which contribute to our cultural repertoire of images, the influential role of libraries in information management and the part which museums play in support of the education sector makes them significant players in forming gendered knowledges. Cultural policy platforms addressing the representation of women in public life should recognise the broader role of the cultural sector in helping to form public opinion and shape our concept of 'the public', extending their brief to include the representation of women in significant public cultural institutions. This has been done in a piecemeal way – for example the Women's National Commission has included the Regional Arts Boards in its guide to women in public appointments (Women's National Commission), and have examined representations of gender across a range of cultural forms including advertising, magazines, video games etc, as well as considering the lack of women working at decision-making levels within the media industries, (Women's National Commission 1997: 41-53). But the issues have yet to be thought through in a way that integrates the relevant areas of the arts, media and cultural sector into a general agenda for change in a positive direction, looking to identify ways to enable women to use the cultural and media industries in a way which reflects their own interests and acts as a means for their own cultural expression, and a contribution to 'the advancement of women' (Women's National Commission, 1997: 41).

Employment Policies, Equity Programmes and Social Exclusion Agendas Should Not be Restricted to Ensuring Baseline Levels for Equity Platforms

A 'crisis management' approach which only addresses the most urgent disparities between men and women, or the most urgent problems for women will not offer the co-ordinated and holistic approach that enables the range of inequalities affecting women to be resolved. In many areas where women are involved in reasonable proportions there is a trend to 'leave it alone' in terms of equity provision, thereby avoiding the recognition of areas of disadvantage and failing to identify significant obstacles. While women do participate in the arts in equal numbers to men, for example, their lower incomes, lower involvement in senior decision-making positions, etc, signals a lack of equality in reward, a set of obstacles to progression, and a lack of equality in terms of impact on the nature of those industries and their ability to reflect the gender profile of the population. The *patterns* of women's participation and disadvantage, and the range of obstacles they encounter across all kinds of involvement, including as cultural consumers, should be researched more rigorously and understood more thoroughly.

References

- Anderson, Janet (1998) 'Putting Women in the Picture', *Carlton Women in Film and Television Awards*, London: Carlton Television.
- Birch, Edward, Jackson, Charles and Towse, Ruth (1998) *Dance, Drama and Stage Management Training: An Examination of Industry Needs and the Relationship with the Current Provision of Training*, London: Arts Council of England.
- British Film Institute (1999) *Television Industry Tracking Study: Third Report*, London: British Film Institute.
- Caple, Tom and Melbourne, Fiona (1997) *An Occupational Map of the Broadcast, film and Video Industry*, London: Skillset.
- Casey, Bernard (1999) 'Employment and Skills in the cultural Sector: some reflections on the European Commission paper "Culture, Culture Industries and Employment"', *Cultural Competence: New Technologies, Culture and Employment*, Vienna: Österreichische Kulturdocumentation.
- Department of Culture, Media and Sport 1998a *Annual Report*, London: Department of Culture, Media and Sport.
- Department of Culture, Media and Sport 1998b *Creative Industries Mapping Document*, London: Department of Culture, Media and Sport.
- Digital Media Alliance Steering Group (1998) *Recommendations for Growth: UK Digital Media*, London: Digital Media Alliance.
- European Commission (1998) *Culture, the Cultural Industries and Employment* (SEC [98] 837 of 14-5-98) Brussels.
- Gallagher, Margaret (1998) *Employment Patterns in European Broadcasting: Prospects for Equality in the 1990s*, Brussels: European Commission.
- Hewitt, Patricia (1995) 'Whose flexibility? Policies for Changing times', *Demos Quarterly*, No 5.
- Honey, Sheila, Heron, Paul and Jackson, Charles (1997) *Career Paths of Visual Artists: ACE Research Report No 11*, London: Arts Council of England.
- Kumari-Dass, Sabita (1997) *Production Training: A Report for Skillset*, London: Skillset.
- Milestone, Katie and Richards, Nicola (1999a) CIREN (Cultural Industries Research Employment NOW) European Social Fund Employment Now Project, Interim Report.
- Milestone, Katie and Richards, Nicola (1999b) 'Potential draws and barriers to the field', paper presented at the New Media: Working Practices in the Electronic Arts conference, London School of Economics, November.

Milestone, Katie (1999) "Your name's not down": Access issues and the cultural industries' *Cultural Industries and the City*, <http://www.mmu.ac.uk/h-ss/sis.index.htm>.

Milestone, Katie and Richards, Nicola (2000) 'What difference does it make? Women's pop cultural production and consumption in Manchester', *Sociological Research On-Line*.

National Advisory Committee on Creative and Cultural Education (1999), *All Our Futures: Creativity, Culture and Education*, London: Department for Education and Employment.

Placca, Jane and Smith, Phil (1996) *Survey of Education and Training in Multimedia in the United Kingdom*, London: Centre for International Technology and Education and ARTEC.

Poland, Fiona, Curran, Monica and Owens, Glyn (1995) *Women and Senior Management: A Research Study of Career Barriers and Progression in the Library and Information Sector*, London: The Library Association.

Policy Action Team 10 (1999) *A Report to the Social Exclusion Unit*, London: Department of Culture, Media and Sport.

Swanson, Gillian and Wise, Patricia (1998) *Digital Futures: Women's Employment in the Multimedia Industries*, Brisbane: Australian Key Centre for Cultural and Media Policy.

Swanson, Gillian and Wise, Patricia (1999) 'Profiling Diversity: Managing Multimedia Industry Development', *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, Vol 6 No 1, Autumn.

TFPL (1999) *Skills for Knowledge Management, A Briefing Paper on behalf of the Library and Information Commission*, London: Library and Information Commission, July.

Willis, Janet and Dex, Shirley (1999) *Mothers Returning to TV Production Work: Equal Opportunities in a Flexible Labour Market*, WP 8/99, Cambridge: The Judge Institute of Management Studies.

Women's National Commission (nd) *Stepping Out in Public: A Woman's Guide to Public Appointments*, London: Women's National Commission.

Women's National Commission (1997) *Growing Up Female in the UK*, London: Women's National Commission.

Woolf, Myra and Holly, Sara (1995) *Employment Patterns and Training Needs 1994/5: Women Freelances*, London: Skillset.

Woolf, Myra, Holly, Sara and Connor, Helen (1996) *Engineers in Broadcasting 1995-6*, London: Skillset.

Woolf, Myra, Holly, Sara and Varlaam, Carol (1994) *Employment Patterns and Training Needs 1993/4: Freelance and Set Crafts Research*, London: Skillset.

Department for Education and Employment (1997) *Labour Market and Skill Trends*. London: Department for Education and Employment.

Negus, K (1992) *Producing Pop*. London: Edward Arnold.

New Earnings Survey (1998) London: HMSO Volumes A and C.

O'Brien, J. and Feist, A. (1995) *Employment in the Arts and Cultural Industries: An Analysis of the 1991 Census*. ACE Research Report No. 2. London: The Arts Council of England.

O'Brien, J and Feist, A (1997) *Employment in the Arts and Cultural Industries: An Analysis of the Labour Force Survey and Other Sources*. ACE Research Report No 9. London: Arts Council of England.

Payne, J. (1995) *Routes Beyond Compulsory Schooling*. Youth Cohort Report No 31. Sheffield: Employment Department.

Peacock, A. and Rizzo, I. (eds) *Cultural Economics and Cultural Policies*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Thair, T. and Risdon, A. (1999) Women in the Labour Market: Results from the Spring 1998 Labour Force Survey. *Labour Market Trends* 107: 3. pp. 103-128.

Thomas, H. (1992) *Equal Opportunities in the Mechanical Media*. London: Equity/Goldsmiths College.

Throsby, D. (1994) A work preference model of artists labour supply. In Peacock, A. and Rizzo, I. (eds) *Cultural Economics and Cultural Policies*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers.